Submission date. 14/02/2025

Associate editor's decision after peer review (08/10/2025).

Dear Dr. Carvalho:

Manuscript ID NI-2025-0030 entitled "Different trade patterns and inspection rates along with the use of umbrella terms results in variable patterns of substitution in shark, hake, and flatfish sold in Brazil." which you submitted to the Neotropical Ichthyology, has been reviewed. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

I apologize for the delay in our response. We have received one referee report for your manuscript ID NI-2025-0030, titled "Different Trade Patterns and Inspection Rates, Along with the Use of Umbrella Terms, Result in Variable Patterns of Substitution in Shark, Hake, and Flatfish Sold in Brazil," which you submitted to Neotropical Ichthyology. While we had hoped to secure a second review, we have unfortunately encountered difficulties with multiple referees. To avoid further delays, the editorial team has decided to proceed with the single review and invite you to revise your manuscript.

To revise your manuscript, log into https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ni-scielo and enter your Author Center, where you will find your manuscript title listed under "Manuscripts with Decisions." Under "Actions," click on "Create a Revision." Your manuscript number has been appended to denote a revision.

You may also click the below link to start the revision process (or continue the process if you have already started your revision) for your manuscript. If you use the below link you will not be required to login to ScholarOne Manuscripts.

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ni-scielo?URL_MASK=a9fdf79e45244d6bbfd951a3f9e4dbe7

You will be unable to make your revisions on the originally submitted version of the manuscript. Instead, revise your manuscript using a word processing program and save it on your computer. Please also highlight the changes to your manuscript within the document by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or colored text. Once the revised manuscript is prepared, upload BOTH versions (the tracked and a clean) and submit them through your Author Center.

When submitting your revised manuscript, you will be able to respond to the comments in the space provided. You can use this space to document any changes you make to the original manuscript. In order to expedite the processing of the revised manuscript, please reply POINT TO POINT all the suggestions of the reviewers and be as specific as possible in your response to the comments.

IMPORTANT: Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to the Neotropical Ichthyology, your revised manuscript should be submitted before 08-Dec-2025. If it is not possible for you to submit your revision by this date, we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Neotropical Ichthyology and I look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,

Dr. Alexandre Wagner Hilsdorf
Associate Editor, Neotropical Ichthyology
awhilsdorf@gmail.com

Anonymous reviewer #1
Recommendation. Major Revision
Comments.
This is an interesting study on the "Different trade patterns and inspection rates along with the use of umbrella terms results in variable patterns of substitution in shark, hake, and flatfish sold in Brazil". There are some interesting results, however, there are some issues that should be addressed.
I present the major issues here and the minor are on the attached pdf file.
1) I would change the title as sampling is not representative of Brazil. Samples were collected from Minas Gerais.
2) There is no clarification of what samples have SIF stamps. This makes things hard to follow in the Results and Discussion.
3) Please use the species name "Prionace glauca" which is the currently accepted scientific name for blue shark.
4) The authors have considered as separate samples, specimens from the same packaging. This is very confusing and causes biases in results. Unfortunately, there is no consistency in how many samples were taken per packaging. No description of what a package is and how many samples are taken per packaging. There are cases with 9 samples per packaging and others with one.
5) Why not include the years 2018-2019 to be consistent with sampling in Minas Gerais? Additionally, as sampling took place in one state, is there specific import/export data per state?
6) It is not clear what is intentional and what is opportunistic substitution in the Results and Discussion. The explanations provided by the authors are contradictory.
7) I do not see the point of the phylogenetic analyses. The results are not discussed and do not provide any additional insights. I would remove them.
Table 2: Replace "Shark, Hake and Flatfish" with "shark, hake and flatfish". Also check Table 3.

Author's Rebuttal Letter (20/01/2026).
Prof José Birindelli,
Neotropical Ichthyology
Dear Prof Birindelli,
Please find attached our second revision of NI-2025-0030entitled "Different trade patterns and inspection rates along with the use of umbrella terms results in variable patterns of substitution in shark, hake, and flatfish sold in Brazil." to be considered for publication in NI.
The manuscript has been revised according to the reviewers' comments, and we have addressed all the reviewers' requests, which are described below, including the list of all modifications made in the text.
We thank you and the reviewers for their suggestions, which have improved our manuscript.
We hope this revision will meet with your approval.
Thank you for considering this paper for publication in NI.
Best regards,
Daniel C. Carvalho

Associate editor's decision after peer review (26/06/2026).
Dear Dr. Carvalho:
Manuscript ID NI-2025-0030.R1 entitled "Different trade patterns and inspection rates along with the use of umbrella terms results in variable patterns of substitution in shark, hake, and flatfish sold in Minas Gerais, Brazil." which you submitted to the Neotropical Ichthyology, has been reviewed. The comments of the reviewer(s) are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) have recommended publication, but also suggest some minor revisions to your manuscript. Therefore, I invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript.
To revise your manuscript, log into https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ni-scielo and enter your Author Center, where you will find your manuscript title listed under "Manuscripts with Decisions." Under "Actions," click on "Create a Revision." Your manuscript number has been appended to denote a revision.
You may also click the below link to start the revision process (or continue the process if you have already started your revision) for your manuscript. If you use the below link you will not be required to login to ScholarOne Manuscripts.
*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***
https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/ni-scielo?URL_MASK=ffc4d77f88bc45f0b7254325ad06db5e
You will be unable to make your revisions on the originally submitted version of the manuscript. Instead, revise your manuscript using a word processing program and save it on your computer. Please also highlight the changes to your manuscript within the document by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or colored text. Once the revised manuscript is prepared, upload BOTH versions (the tracked and a clean) and submit them through your Author Center.
When submitting your revised manuscript, you will be able to respond to the comments in the space provided. You can use this space to document any changes you make to the original manuscript. In order to expedite the processing of the revised manuscript, please reply POINT TO POINT all the suggestions of the reviewers and be as specific as possible in your response to the comments.
IMPORTANT: Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.
Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to the Neotropical Ichthyology, your revised manuscript should be submitted before 27-Jul-2026. If it is not possible for you to submit your revision by this date, we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.
Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the Neotropical Ichthyology and I look forward to receiving your revision.
Sincerely,
Dr. Alexandre Wagner Hilsdorf
Associate Editor, Neotropical Ichthyology
awhilsdorf@gmail.com

Anonymous reviewer #1
Recommendation. Minor Revision
Comments.
This is the second time I have reviewed this manuscript. The authors have addressed most of my comments and
I present the major issues here and the minor are on the attached pdf file.

Major issues:
1) The order of authors and affiliations are a bit confusing. Please reconsider the order of affiliations.
2) There are spaces/gaps throughout the text that are unjustifiable.
3) The Abstracts need more attention.
4) The use of the term “opportunism” is a bit confusing. Please see one of my comments in the text.
5) No replies to my comments were provided from the first round.
6) Why provide topologies, when there is no actual mention in the manuscript? You should remove them.

Anonymous reviewer #2
Recommendation. Minor Revision
Comments.
English language needs review. Minor questions about shark taxonomy and nomenclatural use of Carcharhinus or Prionace need be solves, as mentioned in the attached manuscript.

Author's Rebuttal Letter (24/07/2026).
Dear Dr. Alexandre Hilsdorf,
Thank you for the opportunity to submit this 2nd revision. We apologise for the problems with the previous revision (formatting and confusion with associated files). We believe we have now corrected all required issues.
Sincerely,
Daniel

Associate editor's decision after peer review (03/08/2026).
Dear Dr. Carvalho:
It is a pleasure to accept your manuscript entitled "Different trade patterns and inspection rates along with the use of umbrella terms results in variable patterns of substitution in shark, hake, and flatfish sold in Minas Gerais, Brazil." in its current form for publication in the Neotropical Ichthyology.
Congratulations for the acceptance of your article, and be aware on the following topics:
1. Publication Fee
NI will charge a publication fee if none of the co-authors is an active SBI member. This measure is essential to strengthen SBI and thus ensure the continuity of our journal, scientific society, and biannual meetings. SBI is not limited to Brazilians but is open to anyone interested in freshwater and marine Neotropical fishes. More details on SBI are available at https://www.sbi.bio.br/. Please email tesouraria.sbi@gmail.com to confirm whether any of your co-authors is a current SBI member and to activate your SBI membership if needed. Otherwise, if you will cover the publication fee of R$1.000, please inform us at the same email. For authors outside Brazil, the fee will be converted to US dollars based on the official exchange rate on the date of payment. The only exceptions to this fee are invited articles.
2. Science Communication and Social Media
NI actively promotes published articles to both academic colleagues and the general public, including science journalists. To support this, we create social media posts and require images and/or videos of fish related to your work. If your article does not include such images, please send a photo of a representative fish species, preferably alive in its natural habitat. If you do not have your own photo, you may provide a link to an online image, along with the source, author, and, if applicable, authorization for its use. We also publish video summaries of articles in Portuguese on our Instagram (@neoichth). We ask you to designate one author to record a short video using a mobile phone, following the attached instructions. The video should include visual materials (photos, graphics) and a script for subtitles to enhance accessibility. Please email the completed material to our Social Media Editor, Igor Souto-Santos, at icass.ufrj@gmail.com within 30 days.
Additionally, if your article is taxonomic in nature and has been submitted to Zoobank, it is your responsibility to update the manuscript's status on Zoobank once it has been published.
All of the above information and materials are mandatory for the publication of your article, including the scientific dissemination component, which is crucial in the current climate of science denial and misinformation. If you have any questions, please feel free to contact us at neoichth@nupelia.uem.br.

Please send an e-mail to neoichth@nupelia.uem.br within five working days to let us know you are aware of all the important points mentioned above.
Thank you for your fine contribution. On behalf of the Editors of the Neotropical Ichthyology, we look forward to your continued contributions to the Journal.
Sincerely,
Dr. Alexandre Wagner Hilsdorf
Associate Editor, Neotropical Ichthyology
awhilsdorf@gmail.com

Neotropical Ichthyology

OPEN ACCESS

This is an open access Peer Review File under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. In cases where reviewers are anonymous, credit should be given to 'Anonymous Referee' and the source.

Distributed under
Creative Commons CC-BY 4.0

© 2026 The Authors.
Diversity and Distributions Published by SBI

HOW TO CITE THIS ARTICLE

- **Ready J, Falcão L, Araujo C, Pardinho B, Guimarães N, Freitas L, Sales JBL, Mendes IS, Carvalho DC.** Different trade patterns and inspection rates along with the use of umbrella terms results in variable patterns of substitution in shark, hake, and flatfish sold in Minas Gerais, Brazil. Neotrop Ichthyol. 2026; 24(3):e250030. https://doi.org/10.1590/1982-0224-2025-0030

Official Journal of the
Sociedade Brasileira de Ictiologia